

# Online Appendix

## The Difficult School-to-Work Transition of High School Dropouts: Evidence from a field experiment

by Pierre Cahuc, Stéphane Carcillo and Andreea Minea

### A Robustness check

This appendix reproduces the main analyses based on an alternative and more restrictive definition of the callback rate whereby only calls for setting interviews are considered a positive answer (thus, demands for further information are null, like the absence of callback).

Table A1: Callback Rate Descriptive Statistics

Dependent variable: Callback for an interview	All	Gardener	Receptionist
Résumé attributes			
All applicants	.045 .003	.070 .005	.020 .003
Unemployed	.039 .004	.06 .006	.016 .002
Employed, subsidized, certified skills	.076 .009	.10 .015	.048 .011
Employed, subsidized, no certified skills	.042 .007	.074 .013	.014 .006
Employed, non-subsidized, certified skills	.047 .008	.066 .014	.026 .009
Employed, non-subsidized, no certified skills	.037 .008	.067 .015	.004 .004

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero otherwise. The second column reports the standard deviation of this variable.

Table A2: The Effect of Individual Pathway on Probability of Callback

Dependent variable: Callback for interview		(1)	(2)	(3)	(3)	(4)
		All applicants			Gardener	Receptionist
(1)	Employed, subsidized, certified skills	.036*** .010	.036*** .010	.035*** .010	.035** .015	.029** .012
(2)	Employed, subsidized, no certified skills	.003 .008	.004 .008	.004 .008	.015 .014	-.002 .006
(3)	Employed, non-subsidized, certified skills	.007 .009	.008 .009	.008 .009	.006 .015	.012 .010
(4)	Employed, non-subsidized, no certified skills	-.003 .009	-.003 .009	-.002 .009	.005 .017	-.013** .006
(5)	Constant (ref: unemployed)	.039*** .004	.030*** .008	.029*** .008	.053*** .015	.007 .007
	N	5,388	5,388	5,388	2,720	2,668
	Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.004	.007	.044	.069	.055
	Month fixed effects	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
	Department fixed effects	no	no	yes	yes	yes

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero otherwise. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

Table A3: The Effect of Skill Certification on Probability of Callback

	(1)	(3)	(4)
	All applicants	Gardener	Receptionist
Employment without certified skills	.002 .006	.011 .012	-.006 .005
Employment with certified skills	.023*** .007	.022** .011	.021*** .008
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.029*** .008	.054*** .015	.007 .007
N	5,388	2,720	2,668
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.042	.068	.054

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero in all other cases. Thus, the dependent variable is an indicator variable equal to one if the application gets a callback asking for an interview. Employment with certified skills comprises all applications of applicants who were employed on jobs in the market or non-market sector, with or without subsidy, which offered skill certification. Employment without certified skills comprises all applications of applicants who were employed on jobs in the market or non-market sector, with or without subsidy, which did not offer skill certification. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has a certified skill. All columns include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

Table A4: The Effect of Having Been Employed in Subsidized Jobs vs. Public Jobs on Probability of Callback

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	All applicants		Gardener	Receptionist
<i>Panel A (All job offers)</i>				
Non-subsidized employment	.003 .007	-.009 .008	-.001 .014	-.015** .007
Subsidized employment	.019*** .006	.008 .007	.020 .013	-.001 .006
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.030*** .008	.029*** .008	.053*** .015	.007 .007
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	5,388	5,388	2,720	2,668
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.042	.043	.069	.055
<i>Panel B (Private sector job offers)</i>				
Non-subsidized employment	.001 .007	-.010 .009	-.001 .015	-.017** .008
Subsidized employment	.017*** .007	.008 .008	.021 .014	-.004 .006
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.024*** .008	.023*** .008	.040** .016	.005 .007
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	4,236	4,236	2,104	2,132
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.052	.053	.087	.090
<i>Panel C (Public sector job offers)</i>				
Non-subsidized employment	.010 .017	-.008 .021	.004 .040	-.010 .015
Subsidized employment	.025 .016	.008 .016	.015 .030	.014 .015
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.064** .026	.061** .026	.099** .046	.043 .030
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	1,152	1,152	616	536
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.111	.114	.143	.181

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero in all other cases. Thus, the dependent variable is an indicator variable equal to one if the application gets a callback asking for an interview. Subsidized employment comprises all applications of applicants who were employed on subsidized jobs in the private or public sector, with or without skill certification. Non-subsidized jobs comprises all applications of applicants who were employed on non-subsidized jobs in the private or public sector, with or without skill certification. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has a certified skill. All columns include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

Table A5: The Effect of Having Been Employed in Public Jobs vs. Private Jobs on Probability of Callback

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	All applicants	Gardener	Receptionist	
<i>Panel A (All job offers)</i>				
Private sector experience	.011* .006	.002 .007	.008 .013	-.004 .007
Public sector experience	.013** .007	.001 .007	.016 .014	-.004 .007
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.030*** .008	.029*** .008	.054*** .015	.007 .007
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	5,388	5,388	2,720	2,668
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.041	.042	.069	.054
<i>Panel B (Private sector job offers)</i>				
Private sector experience	.004 .007	-.004 .008	-.000 .014	-.007 .007
Public sector experience	.017** .008	.007 .009	.030* .016	-.012* .006
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.025** .008	.024** .008	.043*** .016	.006 .007
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	4,236	4,236	2,104	2,132
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.051	.052	.088	.089
<i>Panel C (Public sector job offers)</i>				
Market sector experience	.034* .019	.018 .021	.035 .037	.009 .017
Non-market sector experience	.005 .015	-.017 .015	-.021 .029	-.002 .013
Constant (ref: unemployed)	.062** .026	.059** .026	.095** .046	.041 .031
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	1,152	1,152	616	536
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.112	.115	.147	.179

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero in all other cases. Thus, the dependent variable is an indicator equal to one if the application gets a callback asking for an interview. Private employment comprises all applications of applicants who were employed in the private sector, on subsidized or non subsidized jobs, with or without skill certification. Public employment comprises all applications of applicants who were employed in the public sector, on subsidized or non subsidized jobs, with or without skill certification. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has a certified skill. All columns include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

Table A6: The Effect of Subsidized and Public Job Experience on Probability of Callback

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
	All applicants	Gardener	Receptionist	
<i>Panel A (All job offers)</i>				
Non-subsidized private sector experience	-.001 .009	-.009 .010	-.009 .017	-.013 .009
Non-subsidized public sector experience	.006 .009	-.009 .010	.007 .018	-.016* .008
Subsidized public sector experience	.021** .010	.010 .009	.026* .017	-.003 .008
Subsidized private sector experience	.018** .008	.007 .009	.017 .016	.001 .009
Constant (ref:unemployment)	.030*** .008	.029*** .008	.054*** .015	.007 .007
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	5,388	5,388	2,720	2,668
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.042	.043	.069	.055
<i>Panel B (Private sector job offers)</i>				
Non-subsidized market sector experience	-.006 .009	-.014 .010	-.019 .016	-.012 .011
Non-subsidized non-market sector experience	.007 .010	-.006 .012	.018 .022	-.022** .009
Subsidized non-market sector experience	.027** .011	.018* .011	.042** .020	-.004 .009
Subsidized market sector experience	.010 .008	.001 .009	.010 .017	-.005 .009
Constant (ref:unemployment)	.025*** .008	.024*** .008	.042*** .016	.006 .007
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	4,236	4,236	2,104	2,132
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.053	.054	.089	.090
<i>Panel C (Public sector job offers)</i>				
Non-subsidized private sector experience	.026 .030	.013 .033	.051 .060	-.020** .010
Non-subsidized public sector experience	.001 .019	-.025 .020	-.037 .038	-.004 .023
Subsidized public sector experience	.009 .020	-.010 .019	-.011 .034	.002 .020
Subsidized private sector experience	.038* .022	.019 .023	.025 .040	.024 .025
Constant (ref:unemployment)	.062*** .026	.059** .026	.097** .046	.040 .030
Certified skills	no	yes	yes	yes
N	1,152	1,152	616	536
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.112	.116	.148	.182

Note: The dependent variable is an indicator variable equal to one if the application gets a callback asking for an interview and zero in all other cases. Non-subsidized private sector experience comprises all applications of applicants who were employed in the private sector, on non-subsidized jobs, with or without skill certification. Non-subsidized public sector experience comprises all applications of applicants who were employed in the public sector, on non-subsidized jobs, with or without skill certification. Subsidized public sector experience comprises all applications of applicants who were employed in the public sector, on subsidized jobs, with or without skill certification. Subsidized private sector experience comprises all applications of applicants who were employed in the private sector, on subsidized jobs, with or without skill certification. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has a certified skill. All columns include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

Table A7: The Effect of Certified Skills on Probability of Callback by Quintile of Unemployment Rate of the Commuting Zone where the Job was Posted

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
	All	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5
Certified skills	.022*** .007	.050*** .019	.016 .016	.027* .016	.024 .015	.004 .014
Constant	.030*** .008	.032 .021	.059*** .022	.030** .015	.021 .021	.014 .013
Unemployment rate						
Mean	9.58	7.40	8.59	9.31	10.34	12.52
Min	5.45	5.45	8.20	8.95	9.90	10.90
Max	17.60	8.15	8.90	9.80	10.85	17.60
N	5,388	1,078	996	1,020	1,114	936
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.042	.069	.079	.119	.036	.070

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero in all other cases. Thus, the dependent variable is an indicator variable equal to one if the application gets a callback asking for an interview. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has certified skills. QX stands for the number of the quintile of the unemployment rate of the commuting zone of the job offer. Mean, Min and Max denote the mean, the minimum and the maximum value of the quintile of the unemployment rate of the commuting zone respectively. The total number of observations is slightly lower compared with the previous tables because the employment zone was not identified for some job offers. The regressions include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

Table A8: The Effect of Certified Skills on Probability of Callback by Quintile of Callback Rate of the Commuting Zone where the Job was Posted

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
	All	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5
Certified skills	.022*** .007	.000 .	-.005 .014	.039** .015	.035* .018	.046* .025
Constant	.029*** .008	.000 .	-.001 .008	.017 .015	.041 .028	.107*** .030
Callback rate						
Mean	.045	.000	.019	.035	.053	.134
Min	.000	.000	.011	.027	.039	.067
Max	.750	.000	.027	.038	.066	.750
N	5,388	1,544	664	1200	936	1,044
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.043	.	.047	.029	.023	.071

Note: In this table we consider that the callback variable equals one if an interview is requested and zero in all other cases. Thus, the dependent variable is an indicator variable equal to one if the application gets a callback asking for an interview. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has certified skills. QX stands for the number of the quintile of the callback rate of the commuting zone of the job offer. Mean, Min and Max denote the mean, the minimum and the maximum value of the quintile of the callback rate of the commuting zone respectively. The regressions include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.

## B Probit model

Table A9: The Effect of Individual Pathway on Probability of Callback (Marginal Effects at the Mean)

Dependent variable: Received a callback		(1)	(2)	(3)
		All applicants	Gardener	Receptionist
(1)	Employed, subsidized, certified skills	.040*** .009	.045*** .016	.031*** .010
(2)	Employed, subsidized, no certified skills	-.001 .010	-.004 .018	-.006 .010
(3)	Employed, non-subsidized, certified skills	.023** .011	.022 .018	.023** .011
(4)	Employed, non-subsidized, no certified skills	.007 .013	.019 .020	-.011 .016
	N	5,388	2,720	2,668
	Pseudoj-R <sup>2</sup>	.007	.006	.016

Note: The table reports marginal effects for the probability of receiving a callback based on probit regressions. The dependent variable is a dummy variable equal to 1 if the application gets a callback. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the marginal effects. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent

## C Effect of Skill Certification on Probability of Callback by Quintile of Callback Rate

Table A10: The Effect of Skill Certification on Probability of Callback by Quintile of Callback Rate of the Commuting Zone where the Job was Posted

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
	All	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5
Certified skills	.034*** .009	.003 .003	.023 .014	.028 .023	.053** .024	.071** .032
Constant	.061*** .012	-.002 .002	.019 .015	.077** .033	.104** .043	.144*** .042
Callback rate						
Mean	.080	.001	.050	.074	.101	.200
Min	.000	.000	.027	.065	.081	.127
Max	1.000	.022	.062	.079	.125	1.000
N	5,368	1,110	1,424	858	1,026	950
Adj-R <sup>2</sup>	.040	.031	.019	.058	.015	.075

Note: The dependent variable is a dummy variable equal to one if the application gets a callback. Certified skills is an indicator variable equal to 1 if the applicant has a skill certification. QX stands for the number of the quintile of the callback rate of the commuting zone of the job offer. Mean, Min and Max denote the mean, the minimum and the maximum value of the quintile of the callback rate of the commuting zone respectively. The regressions include department and month fixed effects. Robust standard errors are clustered at the job level and reported below the coefficients. \* significant at 10 percent, \*\* significant at 5 percent, \*\*\* significant at 1 percent.



## D Examples of applications

### Application email messages

**For the type 1 application**, the email message was the following :

Dear Madam, Dear Sir,

Following your offer XXX for a job of YYY, I am pleased to send you my application.

Please find enclosed my cover letter and my resume.

Yours sincerely,

*ZZZ*

**For the type 2 application**, the email message was the following :

Dear Sir/Madam,

I am pleased to submit my application for the position YYY following your offer XXX published on the Pôle Emploi website.

I am sending you enclosed my CV and my cover letter.

Yours faithfully,

*ZZZ*

*Application reply email messages*

**Type 1 reply to the employer who contacted the applicant :**

Dear Madam, Dear Sir,

Thank you for your reply to my application. But the fact is, I have just accepted another employment offer.

Yours sincerely,

*ZZZ*

**Type 2 reply to the employer who contacted the applicant :**

Dear Sir/Madam,

Thank you for your interest in my application. However, I cannot follow it up, as I have just accepted another job proposal.

Yours faithfully,

*ZZZ*

*CV Receptionist- Unemployed, 3 summer jobs*

**Mathieu Richard**

3, rue d'Ypres  
01000 Bourg-en-Bresse  
06 26 26 93 40  
[mathieu.rchd@gmail.com](mailto:mathieu.rchd@gmail.com)

Born on 05/06/1992  
Single

Driving license: B

**PROFESSIONAL SKILLS**

---

Good social skills, document monitoring, good computer skills, communication skills with various audiences

**PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCES**

---

11/12 - 11/15 (Volunteer): Receptionist, Sports Association Sport in the City

09/15 - 10/15 (Fixed-term contract): Salesperson, Conforama

07/14 - 08/14 (Fixed-term contract): Crew member, McDonald's

09/13 - 10/13 (Fixed-term contract): Salesperson, Conforama

**EDUCATION**

---

2009-2011: Training in a "Local services, Specialization: Management of spaces open to the public" degree seeking to obtain the professional Baccalaureate

2009: Middle-school Certificate

**FOREIGN LANGUAGES**

---

English: beginner (reading + ; writing + ; speaking +)

**IT**

---

General office automation tools: word processing, spreadsheets, internet

**INTERESTS**

---

Handicrafts, Cinema, Sports

**Cover letter Receptionist- Unemployed, 3 summer jobs**

Mathieu Richard  
3, rue d'Ypres  
01000 Bourg-en-Bresse  
Tel : 06 26 26 93 40  
[mathieu.rchd@gmail.com](mailto:mathieu.rchd@gmail.com)

Monday, 29 January 2016

Object : *Application Receptionist*

Dear Sir/Madam,

Allow me to explain why I am well suited for your position as a receptionist.

After passing my middle-school certificate, I chose to prepare a professional Baccalaureate in "Local services, Specialization: Management of spaces open to the public". This choice corresponds to my strong interest in welcoming the public. During these studies, I was able to acquire several skills: communication with the public, administrative tasks, making appointments and understanding the functioning of local services.

I then chose to pursue this path and apply this knowledge. I have held fixed-term positions as a salesperson and a team member. I also volunteered three nights a week to work as a receptionist for a sports association. This experience has been very beneficial for me. I was able to develop as part of a team and meet the expectations of the people I interacted with, both users and staff. On the other hand, I had to carry out the administrative tasks entrusted to me and to learn how to participate in the secretariat. Thus, these three years of practice gave me the opportunity to confirm my interest in this field.

I think that the skills I have developed and the experience I have acquired will allow me to respond to your expectations. I would thus be happy to meet with you and discuss my interest in this position.

Yours sincerely,  
Mathieu Richard

*CV Gardener- Employed, market, subsidized, certified skills*

**Romain Moreau**

1, rue Villeneuve  
01000 Bourg-en-Bresse  
06 46 61 96 41  
[romain.moreau.1992@gmail.com](mailto:romain.moreau.1992@gmail.com)

Born on 22/04/1992  
Single

Driving license B

**PROFESSIONAL SKILLS**

---

Planting and plant cutting techniques, maintenance of lawns, plants and flowers, use of mowing machines, knowledge of soils and plants

**PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE**

---

12/12 - 12/15 (Fixed-term Emploi d'avenir): Gardener, Blanc Mesnil Distribution

**FORMATION**

---

2015: Vocational title "Landscape worker" Level V

2009-2011: Training in a "Landscaping" degree seeking to obtain the professional Baccalaureate

2009: Middle-school Certificate

**FOREIGN LANGUAGES**

---

English: beginner (reading + ; writing + ; speaking +)

**INTERESTS**

---

Hand-ball

Music

Volunteer in an association promoting social and cultural activities

**Cover letter Gardener- Employed, market, subsidized, certified skills**

Romain Moreau  
1, rue Villeneuve  
01000 Bourg-en-Bresse  
Tel : 06 46 61 96 41  
[romain.moreau.1992@gmail.com](mailto:romain.moreau.1992@gmail.com)

29 January 2016

Object: Application for a Gardener Job

Dear Madam,  
Dear Sir,

Allow me to explain why I am well suited for the position of gardener you are proposing.

After acquiring my middle-school certificate, I chose to orient myself towards the development and maintenance of landscaped spaces. I therefore did two years of training in a "Landscaping" degree in order to prepare the professional Baccalaureate. This training allowed me to acquire several skills: the implementation of earthworks, the installation of watering, as well as planting and landscaping techniques. On the other hand, I had the opportunity to work in a team and to understand the expectations of the people who were hiring me.

Today, I am pleased to have been able to benefit from a fixed-term contract in an "Emploi d'avenir" as a gardener for Blanc Mesnil Distribution. This initial experience encourages me to persevere in this field, especially as I obtained the vocational title of "Landscape Worker". At the same time, I have taken part in various sports, but also cultural and associative activities that gave me a taste for effort and commitment. I thus believe I will be able to meet your expectations and make use of my skills while working for you.

I would be delighted to meet you and would be pleased to answer any questions you may have.

Yours sincerely,  
Romain Moreau

*CV Gardener- Employed, non-market, non-subsidized, no certified skills*

## Mathieu Richard

Date of birth: 22/04/1992  
Single  
Driving license B

3, rue d'Ypres  
01000 Bourg-en-Bresse  
06 26 26 93 40  
[mathieu.richard.1992@gmail.com](mailto:mathieu.richard.1992@gmail.com)

---

### TRAINING

2009-2011      Preparation of a professional Baccalaureate in "**Landscaping**"  
2009            Middle-school certificate

---

### EMPLOYMENT

12/12 - 12/15    **Gardener**, Paris Habitat OPH (fixed-term contract)

---

### COMPETENCIES

Knowledge of plants, planting methods, size technique and use of cutting tools, maintenance of surfaces and lawns, adaptability (climate, building sites, etc.)

---

### LANGUAGES

English            Good written and oral notions

---

### HOBBIES

Hand-ball  
Music  
Volunteer in an association promoting social and cultural activities

**Cover letter Gardener- Employed, non-market, non-subsidized, no certified skills**

Mathieu Richard  
3, rue d'Ypres  
01000 Bourg-en-Bresse  
06 26 26 93 40  
[mathieu.richard.1992@gmail.com](mailto:mathieu.richard.1992@gmail.com)

Monday, 29 January 2016

**Object: Gardener position application**

Dear Sir/Madam,

I recently learned your had a gardener job opening and I would be happy to answer your needs.

Following my middle-school diploma, passed successfully in 2009, I took a strong interest in landscaping. I therefore attended a degree in order to prepare a professional Baccalaureate in this field. During these studies, I learned to conceive, develop and implement landscape projects. In particular, I worked on landscape development (drainage, watering), planting and decoration, as well as the use of the required maintenance equipment. I also took an active part in several sports and associative activities that allowed me to learn how to work in a team and to develop projects.

Since the end of my studies, I have sought to enhance my skills through professional experiences. I thus had an Emploi d' Avenir open-ended contract as a gardener for Paris Habitat OPH. This experience allowed me to extend my training and sharpened my interest in gardening. I was thus able not only to deepen my theoretical knowledge but also to acquire hands-on skills by working in a team where a rotation of the tasks took place. This first experience encourages me to persevere in this field.

I am highly motivated by the prospect of continuing on this path and working with your team. I therefore stress again all my interest in your job opening.

Yours faithfully,

Mathieu Richard