

Supplementary Materials

Table S1. A summary of factors that hold the potential to undermine long-term sustainability of restoration efforts

Undermining factors	% of papers (n = 36)	Examples	Further reading
Power abuse and increased inequity	64%	Science regarded as the only valid source of knowledge; local values delegitimised; technical and scientific focus presents limited opportunities for effective participation; power dynamics integral to local community dynamics.	Nagothu 2001; Weiss 2004; Figueroa & Aronson 2006; Fleeger & Becker 2008; Kaplan & Kaplan 2009; Buijs 2009; Stenseke 2009; Cao et al. 2010; Badola et al. 2012; Januchowski-Hartley et al. 2012; Leino & Peltomaa 2012; Schwartz et al. 2012; Vishnudas et al. 2012; Bhan 2013; Le Lay et al. 2013; Lu et al. 2013; Aberg & Tapsell 2013; Editorial 2014; He 2014; Benages-Albert et al. 2015; Couix & Turpin 2015; Sandlos & Keeling 2016; Weng 2015.
Ignoring and/or generating negative livelihood impacts	44%	Restrictions on local people's use of resources; emphasis on ecological goals to the detriment of livelihood goals.	Nagothu 2001; Weiss 2004; Buijs 2009; Stenseke 2009; Balana et al. 2010; Cao et al. 2010; Orsi et al. 2011; Januchowski-Hartley et al. 2012; Dang et al. 2013; Lu et al. 2013; Wilson et al. 2013; Zhong et al. 2013; He 2014; Krasny et al. 2014; Couix & Turpin 2015; Fan et al. 2015.
Untested assumptions about local communities	36%	Local communities regarded as the key degrading force; local communities idealised and dynamics simplified.	Nagothu 2001; Lu et al. 2005; Fleeger & Becker 2008; Stone et al. 2008; Stenseke 2009; Januchowski-Hartley et al. 2012; Leino & Peltomaa 2012; Luyet et al. 2012; Zhong et al. 2013; Wilson et al. 2013; Fan et al. 2015; Sakurai et al. 2015; Weng 2015.

Table S2. A summary of strategies to support effective community engaged ecological restoration projects

Strategies	% of papers (n=68)	Rationale	Further reading
Active community participation	59%	Fosters greater buy in & facilitates a just process that supports local people's needs.	Hodge & McNally 2000; Nagothu 2001; Lefevre & Bouchard 2002; Valladares-Padua et al. 2002; Goltenboth & Hutter 2004; Lu et al. 2005; Cheng & McBride 2006; Linkov et al. 2006; Yeemin et al. 2006; Thorton et al. 2007; Fleeger & Becker 2008; Stone et al. 2008; Buijs 2009; Schaich 2009; Stenseke 2009; Balana et al. 2010; Ritzema et al. 2010; Lagabriele et al. 2011; Singh et al. 2011; Badola et al. 2012; Luyet et al. 2012; Vishnudas et al. 2012; Aberg & Tapsell 2013; Bhan 2013; Furukawa 2013; Le Lay et al. 2013; Lu et al. 2013; He 2014; Middle et al. 2014; Sheffield et al. 2014; Zhu & Li 2014; Benages-Albert et al. 2015; Binder et al. 2015; Bouleau & Pont 2015; Couix & Turpin 2015; Giebels et al. 2015; Horton et al. 2015; Sakurai et al. 2015; Sandlos & Keeling 2016; Weng 2015;
Supporting local livelihoods	29%	Ensures a more equitable process where local people's well being is not undermined.	Valladares-Padua et al. 2002; Goltenboth & Hutter 2004; Weiss 2004; Lu et al. 2005; Aronson et al. 2006; Stone et al. 2008; Dong-dong et al. 2009; Balana et al. 2010; Cao et al. 2010; Ritzema et al. 2010; Badola et al. 2012; Orsi et al. 2011; Singh et al. 2011; Vishnudas et al. 2012; Aberg & Tapsell 2013; Dang et al. 2013; Lu et al. 2013; Zhong et al. 2013; Zhu & Li 2014; Fan et al. 2015.
Respecting people's values & perspectives	27%	Promotes feelings of emotional connection & increased cultural value with the local landscape.	Aronson et al. 2006; Miller 2006; Buijs 2009; Kaplan & Kaplan 2009; Reed et al. 2009; Schaich 2009; Stenseke 2009; Fischer & Marshall 2010; Ritzema et al. 2010; Januchowski-Hartley et al. 2012; BenDor & Riggsbee 2011; Aberg & Tapsell 2013; Le Lay et al. 2013; Asah et al. 2014; Valck et al. 2014; Benages-Albert et al. 2015; Couix & Turpin 2015; Sakurai et al. 2015.
Fostering learning	19%	Deepening knowledge of social-ecological systems supports reality cognizance & greater adaption of human systems with the ecological world.	Kiker et al. 2001; Linkov et al. 2006; Stenseke 2009; Fu et al. 2010; Singh et al. 2011; Leino & Peltomaa 2012; McCarthy 2012; Le Lay et al. 2013; Wilson et al. 2013; Krasny et al. 2014; Couix & Turpin 2015; Giebels et al. 2015; Weng 2015.

Strategies	% of papers (n=68)	Rationale	Further reading
Providing environmental education	15%	Promotes healthier social-ecological system interaction by strengthening human knowledge of, connection with & positive action in the ecological world.	Valladares-Padua et al. 2002; Goltenboth & Hutter 2004; Cardoso et al. 2007; Schaich 2009; Balana et al. 2010; Badola et al. 2012; Le Lay et al. 2013; Horton et al. 2015; Sun et al. 2015; Weng 2015.
Supporting local institutions	13%	Institutions provide the link between human & ecological systems	Kiker et al. 2001; Nagothu 2001; Weiss 2004; Lu et al. 2005; Stenseke 2009; Balana et al. 2010; Singh et al. 2011; Wilson et al. 2013; He 2014.
Applying useful models, tools & approaches	13%	Provides a systematic means to meet community orientated ecological restoration objectives.	Sen et al. 2000; Linkov et al. 2006; Balana et al. 2010; Ritzema et al. 2010; Lagabrielle et al. 2011; Orsi et al. 2011; Dang et al. 2013; Rehr et al. 2014; Romanach et al. 2014.
Building relationships	12%	Develops trust and supports effective participatory processes	

References

- Åberg, E.U. and S. Tapsell. 2013. Revisiting the River Skerne: The long-term social benefits of river rehabilitation. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 113: 94–103.
- Allison, S.K. 2004. What do we mean when we talk about Ecological Restoration? *Ecological Restoration* 22 (4): 281–286.
- Aronson, J., C. Floret., E. LeFloch., C. Ovalle and R. Pontanier. Restoration and Rehabilitation of Degraded Ecosystems in Arid and Semi-Arid Lands. I. A view from the South. *Restoration Ecology*: March.
- Aronson, J., S. J. Milton., J.N. Blignaut and A.F. Clewell. 2006. Nature conservation as if people mattered. *Journal for Nature Conservation* 14: 260–263.
- Asah, S.T., M.M. Lenentine and D.J. Blah. 2014. Benefits of urban landscape eco-volunteerism: Mixed methods segmentation analysis and implications for volunteer retention. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 123: 108–113.
- BenDor, T.K. and A.J. Riggsbee. 2011. A survey of entrepreneurial risk in U.S. wetland and stream compensatory mitigation markets. *Environmental Science & Policy* 14: 301–314.
- Bhan, S. 2013. Land degradation and integrated watershed management in India. *International Soil and Conservation Research* 1 (1): 49–57.
- Bouleau, G. and D. Pont. 2015. Did you say reference conditions? Ecological and socio-economic perspectives on the European Water Framework Directive. *Environmental Science & Policy* 47: 32–41.
- Bradshaw, B. 2003. Questioning the credibility and capacity of community-based resource management. *The Canadian Geographer / Le Géographe canadien* 47 (2): 137–150.

- Burke, S.M. and N. Mitchell. 2007. People as Ecological Participants in Ecological Restoration. *Restoration Ecology* 15 (2): 348–350.
- Cardoso, P.G., M. Bankovic., D. Raffaelli and M.A. Pardal. 2007. Polychaete assemblages as indicators of habitat recovery in a temperate estuary under eutrophication. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 71: 301–308.
- Casagrande, D. and M. Vasquez. 2009. Restoring for cultural-ecological sustainability in Arizona and Connecticut. Pages 195-209, in M. Hall (ed.), *Restoration and History: The Search for a Usable Environmental Past*. New York: Routledge Press.
- Castro, A.P. and E. Nielsen. 2001. Indigenous people and co-management: implications for conflict management. *Environmental Science & Policy* 4: 229–239.
- Cheng, S. and J.R. McBride. 2006. Restoration of the urban forests of Tokyo and Hiroshima following World War II. *Urban Forestry & Urban Greening* 5: 155–168.
- Choi, Y.D., V.M. Temperton., E.B. Allen., A.P. Grootjans., M. Halassy., R.J. Hobbs, M.A. Naeth and K. Torok. 2008. Ecological restoration for future sustainability in a changing environment. *Écoscience* 15:1, 53–64.
- Clewell, A.F. and J. Aronson. 2013. *Principles, Values and Structure of an Emerging Profession (2nd eds)*. Washington: Island Press.
- Couix, N. and H. Gonzalo-Turpin. 2015. Towards a land management approach to ecological restoration to encourage stakeholder participation. *Land Use Policy* 46: 155–162.
- Dang, X., G. Liu., S. Xue and P. Li. 2013. An ecological footprint and emergy based assessment of an ecological restoration program in the Loess Hilly Region of China. *Ecological Engineering* 61: 258–267.
- Datta, D., R.N. Chattopadhyay and P. Guha. 2012. Community based mangrove management: A review on status and sustainability. *Journal of Environmental Management* 107: 84–95.
- Davis, M.A. and L.B. Slobodkin. 2004. The Science and Values of Restoration Ecology. *Restoration Ecology* 12 (1): 1–3.
- Dong-dong, Z., S. Yu-shan and L. Le. 2009. Study on sustainable landscape design of abandoned quarries. An example: Zhushan ecological park in Xuzhou. *Procedia Earth and Planetary Science* 1: 1107–1113.
- Egan, D., E.E. Hjerpe and J. Abrams. 2011. Why People Matter in Ecological Restoration. Pages 1-20 in D. Egan., E.E. Hjerpe and J. Abrams (eds), *Human Dimensions of Ecological Restoration: Integrating Science, Nature and Culture*. Washington DC: Island Press.
- Fan, M., Y. Li and W. Li. 2015. Solving one problem by creating a bigger one: The consequences of ecological resettlement for grassland restoration and poverty alleviation in Northwestern China. *Land Use Policy* 42: 124–130.
- Fischer, A. and K. Marshall. 2010. Framing the landscape: Discourses of woodland restoration and moorland management in Scotland. *Journal of Rural Studies* 26: 185-193.
- Fleeger, W.E. and M.L. Becker. 2008. Creating and sustaining community capacity for ecosystem-based management: Is local government the key? *Journal of Environmental Management* 88: 1396–1405.
- Folke, C. and L. Gunderson. 2012. Reconnecting to the Biosphere: A Social-Ecological Renaissance. *Ecology and Society* 17 (4): 55.
- Fox, H. 2014. *Social-ecological resilience for well-being. A Critical Realist case study of Boksburg Lake*. PhD dissertation, Rhodes University.
- Fu, B., S. Li., X. Yu., P. Yang., G. Yu., R. Feng and X. Zhuang. 2010. Chinese ecosystem research network: Progress and perspectives. *Ecological Complexity* 7: 225–233.
- Furukawa, K. 2013. Case studies for urban wetlands restoration and management in Japan.

- Ocean & Coastal Management* 81: 97–102.
- Garibaldi, A. and N. Turner 2004. Cultural Keystone Species: Implications for Ecological Conservation and Restoration. *Ecology and Society* 9 (3): 1.
- Giebels, D., A. van Buuren and J. Edelenbos. 2015. Using knowledge in a complex decision-making process – Evidence and principles from the Danish Houting project’s ecosystem-based management approach. *Environmental Science & Policy* 47: 53–67.
- Goltenboth, F. and C. Hutter. 2004. New options for land rehabilitation and landscape ecology in Southeast Asia by “rainforestation farming”. *Journal for Nature Conservation* 12: 181–189.
- He, J. 2014. Governing forest restoration: Local case studies of sloping land conversion program in Southwest China. *Forest Policy and Economics* 46: 30–38.
- Higgs, E.S. 1997. What is Good Ecological Restoration? *Conservation Biology* 11(2): 338–348.
- Higgs, E.S. 2005. The Two-Culture Problem: Ecological Restoration and the Integration of Knowledge. *Restoration Ecology* 13 (1): 159–164.
- Higgs, E.S. 2017. Ecological Restoration. *Encyclopedia of Science, Technology, and Ethics*: July. <http://www.encyclopedia.com>.
- Hodge, I. and S. McNally. 2000. Wetland restoration, collective action and the role of water management institutions. *Ecological Economics* 35: 107–118.
- Horton, M., A. Keys., L. Kirkwood., F. Mitchell., R. Kyle and D. Roberts. 2015. Sustainable catchment restoration for reintroduction of captive bred freshwater pearl mussels *Margaritifera margaritifera*. *Limnologica* 50: 21–28.
- Januchowski-Hartley, S. R., K. Moon., N. Stoeckl and S. Gray. 2012. Social factors and private benefits influence landholders’ riverine restoration priorities in tropical Australia. *Journal of Environmental Management* 110: 20e26.
- Kaplan, S. and R. Kaplan. 2009. Creating a larger role for environmental psychology: The Reasonable Person Model as an integrative framework. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 29: 329–339.
- Kellert, S.R., J.N. Mehta., S.A. Ebbing and L.L. Lichtenfeld. 2000. Community Natural Resource Management: Promise, Rhetoric, and Reality. *Society and Natural Resources* 13: 705–715.
- Kiker, C.F., J.W. Milon and A.W. Hodges. 2001. South Florida: The reality of change and the prospects for sustainability: Adaptive learning for science-based policy: the Everglades restoration. *Ecological Economics* 37(3): 403–416.
- Krasny, M.E., A. Russ., K.G. Tidball and T. Elmqvist. 2014. Civic ecology practices: Participatory approaches to generating and measuring ecosystem services in cities. *Ecosystem Services* 7: 177–186.
- Kumar, C. 2005. Revisiting ‘community’ in community-based natural resource management. *Community Development Journal* 40 (3): 275–285.
- Lagabrielle, E., M. Rouget., T. Bourgeois., K. Payet., L. Durieux., S. Baret., J. Dupont and D. Strasberg. 2011. Integrating conservation, restoration and land-use planning in islands—An illustrative case study in Réunion Island (Western Indian Ocean). *Landscape and Urban Planning* 101: 120–130.
- Leino, H. and J. Peltomaa. 2012. Situated knowledge—situated legitimacy: Consequences of citizen participation in local environmental governance. *Policy and Society* 31: 159–168.
- Lefevre, J. and V. Bouchard. 2002. From a civil engineering project to an ecological engineering project: An historical perspective from the Mont Saint Michel bay (France). *Ecological Engineering* 18: 593–606.
- Le Lay, Y., H. Piégay and A. Rivière-Honegger. 2013. Perception of braided river

- landscapes: Implications for public participation and sustainable management. *Journal of Environmental Management* 119: 1–12.
- Light, A. and E. Higgs. 1996. The politics of Ecological Restoration. *Environmental Ethics* 18: 227–247.
- Linkov, I., F.K. Satterstrom., G. Kiker., C. Batchelor., T. Bridges and E. Ferguson. 2006. From comparative risk assessment to multi-criteria decision analysis and adaptive management: Recent developments and applications. *Environment International* 32(8): 1072–1093.
- Lu, D., Y. Chou and H. Yuan. 2005. Paradigm shift in the institutional arrangement of protected areas management in Taiwan—a case study of Wu-Wei-Kang Waterfowl Wildlife Refuge in Ilan, Taiwan. *Environmental Science & Policy* 8: 418–430.
- Lu, Y., Z. Ma., L. Zhang., B. Fu and G. Gao. 2013. Redlines for the greening of China. *Environmental Science & Policy* 33: 346–353.
- Luyet, V., R. Schlaepfer., M.B. Parlange and A. Buttler. 2012. A framework to implement Stakeholder participation in environmental projects. *Journal of Environmental Management* 111: 213e219.
- McCarthy, P.D. 2012. Climate Change Adaptation for People and Nature: A Case Study from the U.S. Southwest. *Advances in Climate Change Research* 3(1): 22–37.
- Middle, I., P. Dzidic., A. Buckley., D. Bennett., M. Tye and R. Jones. 2014. Integrating community gardens into public parks: An innovative approach for providing ecosystem services in urban areas. *Urban Forestry & Urban Greening* 13: 638–645.
- Miller, J. R. 2006. Restoration, reconciliation, and reconnecting with nature nearby. *Biological Conservation* 127: 356–361.
- Musumali, M.M., S. Larsen and B.P. Kaltenborn. 2007. An impasse in community based natural resource management implementation: the case of Zambia and Botswana. *Oryx* 41(3): 306-313.
- Nachmias, C. and D. Nachmias. 1990. *Research methods in the social sciences (2nd edition)*. London: Edward Arnold.
- Orsi, F., R.L. Church and D. Geneletti. 2011. Restoring forest landscapes for biodiversity conservation and rural livelihoods: A spatial optimisation model. *Environmental Modelling & Software* 26: 1622e1638.
- Ostrom, E. 1990. *Governing the Commons. The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action*. United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.
- Pierce, S., R. Cowling., A. Mills., M. Powell and A. Sigwela. 2009. Restoring valuable spekboomveld using the international carbon market. *Botanic Gardens Conservation International*: 6 (1).
- Ramirez-Andreotta, M.D., M.L. Brusseau., J.F. Artiola., R.M. Maier and J. Gandol. 2014. Environmental Research Translation: Enhancing interactions with communities at contaminated sites. *Science of the Total Environment* 497–498: 651–664.
- Reed., M.S., A. Bonn., W. Slee., N. Beharry-Borg., J. Birch., I. Brown., T.P. Burte., D. Chapman., P.J. Chapman., G.D. Clay., S.J. Cornelli., E.D.G. Fraser., J.H. Glass., J. Holdeng., J.A. Hodgsoni., K. Hubacek., B. Irvine., N. Jin., M.J. Kirkby., W.E. Kunin., O. Moore., D. Moseley., C. Prell., M.F. Price., C.H. Quinn., S. Redpath., C. Reid., S. Stagl., L.C. Stringer., M. Termansen., S. Thorp., W. Towers and F. Worrall. 2009. The future of the uplands. *Land Use Policy* 26S: S204–S216.
- Rehr, A.P., G.D. Williams and P.S. Levin. 2014. A test of the use of computer generated visualizations in support of ecosystem-based management. *Marine Policy* 46: 14–18.
- Ribot, J.C. 2002. *Democratic decentralization of Natural Resources: Institutionalising Popular Participation*. World Resources Institute.

- Ritzema, H., J. Froebrich., R. Raju., C. Sreenivas and R. Kselik. 2010. Using participatory modelling to compensate for data scarcity in environmental planning: A case study from India. *Environmental Modelling & Software* 25(11): 1450–1458.
- Romanach, S.S., M. McKelvy., C. Conzelmann and K. Suir. 2014. A visualization tool to support decision making in environmental and biological planning. *Environmental Modelling & Software* 62: 221–229.
- Saito-Jensen, M., I. Nathan and T. Treue, T. 2010. Beyond elite capture? Community-based natural resource management and power in Mohammed Nagar village, Andhra Pradesh, India. *Environmental Conservation* 37(3): 327–335.
- Sakurai, R., H. Kobori., M. Nakamura and T. Kikuchi. 2015. Factors influencing public participation in conservation activities in urban areas: A case study in Yokohama, Japan. *Biological Conservation* 184: 424–430.
- Sandlos, J. and A. Keeling. 2016. Aboriginal communities, traditional knowledge, and the environmental legacies of extractive development in Canada. *The Extractive Industries and Society* 3(2): 278–287.
- Schaich, H. 2009. Local residents' perceptions of floodplain restoration measures in Luxembourg's Syr Valley. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 93(1): 20–30.
- Sen, T.K., J. L. Moore and T.J. Hess. 2000. An organizational decision support system for managing the DOE hazardous waste cleanup program. *Decision Support Systems* 29: 89–109
- Shackelford, N., R.J. Hobbs., J.M. Burgar., T.E. Erickson., J.B. Fontaine., E. Laliberté. C.E. Ramalho., M.P. Perring and R.J. Standish. 2013. Restoration for the 21st Century. *Restoration Ecology* 21 (3): 297–304.
- Shackleton, S., B. Campbell., E. Wollenberg and D. Edmunds. 2002. Devolution and community-based natural resource management: creating space for local people to participate and benefit. *Natural Resources Perspectives* 76: 1–6.
- Singh, V.S., D.N. Pandey and N.P. Prakash. 2011. What determines the success of joint forest management? Science-based lessons on sustainable governance of forests in India. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling* 56(1): 126–133.
- Sheffield, P., M. Rowe., D. Agu., L. Rodríguez and K. Avilés. 2014. Health Impact Assessments for Environmental Restoration: The Case of Caño Martín Peña. *Annals of Global Health* 80: 296–302.
- Singh, V.S., D.N. Pandey and N.P. Prakash. 2011. What determines the success of joint forest management? Science-based lessons on sustainable governance of forests in India. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling* 56(1): 126–133.
- Society for Ecological Restoration International Science and Policy Working Group. 2002. *The SER Primer on Ecological Restoration*, First Edition.
- Society for Ecological Restoration International Science & Policy Working Group (2004). *The SER International Primer on Ecological Restoration*, Second Edition. Tucson, Arizona,
- Souza., M.L. Wilkerson and M. Zylberberg. 2012. Perspectives on the Open Standards for the Practice of Conservation. *Biological Conservation* 155: 169–177.
- Stenseke, M. 2009. Local participation in cultural landscape maintenance: Lessons from Sweden. *Land Use Policy* 26: 214–223.
- Stone, K., M. Bhat., R. Bhatta and A. Mathews. 2008. Factors influencing community participation in mangroves restoration: A contingent valuation analysis. *Ocean & Coastal Management* 51: 476–484.
- Sun, Z., W. Sun., C. Tong., C. Zeng., X. Yu and X. Mou. 2015. China's coastal wetlands: Conservation history, implementation efforts, existing issues and strategies for future improvement. *Environment International* 79: 25–41.

- Thornton, J.A., T.M., Slawski, S.W. Teske., W. Rast and M.R. Cascio. 2007. The World Lake Vision and ecohydrology: case study from Wisconsin, USA. *Ecohydrology & Hydrobiology* 7 (2).
- Valladares-Padua, C., S.M. Padua and L. Cullen. 2002. Within and surrounding the Morro do Diabo State Park: biological value, conflicts, mitigation and sustainable development alternatives. *Environmental Science & Policy* 5: 69–78.
- Van Diggelen, R., P. Grootjans and J.A. Harris 2001. Ecological Restoration: State of the Art or State of the Science? *Restoration Ecology* 9 (2): 115–118.
- Vishnudas, S., H.H.G. Savenije and P. van der Zaag. 2012. Watershed development practices for ecorestoration in a tribal area – A case study in Attappady hills, South India. *Physics and Chemistry of the Earth* 47–48: 58–63.
- Weiss, G. 2004. The political practice of mountain forest restoration—comparing restoration concepts in four European countries. *Forest Ecology and Management* 195: 1–13.
- Weng, Y. 2015. Contrasting visions of science in ecological restoration: Expert-lay dynamics between professional practitioners and volunteers. *Geoforum* 65: 134–145.
- Wilson, J., A. Hayden and M. Kersula. 2013. The governance of diverse, multi-scale fisheries in which there is a lot to learn. *Fisheries Research* 141: 24–30.
- Winterhalder, K., A.F. Clewell and J. Aronson. 2004. Values and Science in Ecological Restoration—A Response to Davis and Slobodkin. *Restoration Ecology* 12 (1): 4–7.
- Yeemin, T., M. Sutthacheep and Pettongma, R. 2006. Coral reef restoration projects in Thailand. *Ocean & Coastal Management* 49: 562–575.
- Zhong, B., S. Peng., Q. Zhang., H. Ma and S. Cao. 2013. Using an ecological economics approach to support the restoration of collapsing gullies in southern China. *Land Use Policy* 32: 119–124.
- Zhu, Q. and Y. Li. 2014. Environmental Restoration in the Shiyang River Basin, China: Conservation. *Aquatic Procedia* 2: 24–34.